



**LIBERTY SCHOOL DISTRICT No. 25
GOVERNING BOARD MINUTES**

TIME: November 5, 2018 – 6:30 PM

PLACE: Las Brisas Academy Theatre, 18211 West Las Brisas Drive, Goodyear, AZ 85338

I. OPENING MEETING

1. Mr. Paul Jensen, Governing Board President, called the meeting to order at 6:39 p.m. Governing Board members constituting a quorum were present: Mr. Mark Aguire, Mrs. Yolanda Lopez-Bearden, and Mrs. Kathy McNamara.
2. Pledge of Allegiance was led by Mr. Jensen.
3. A motion by Mrs. McNamara/Mr. Aguire was entered to approve the Regular Agenda Form and Consent Agenda consistent with Board Policy BEDB and temporarily suspend Governing Board Policy with which this agenda may be inconsistent.

Approved

UNANIMOUS

4. **School Presentation / Recognitions**

- Principal Mrs. Reynolds from Freedom Elementary School introduced Emilio and Esteban S., Kadince H., Mrs. McShane, and Mrs. Santos. Emilio stated during the Makerspace the 2nd graders did imaginative building exercises with every day household items. They presented some of the items that were built during the Makerspace. Mrs. McShane stated that many of the parents got involved as the night went on. She further stated the kids got \$20 worth of donations and they looked forward to January's Makerspace. Mrs. McNamara asked if they found anything they would do differently for January's Makerspace. Emilio stated they will plan better to ensure they are more prepared but are overall happy with the outcome. Emilio further spoke about the Summit he attended in Washington, D.C. The seminars he attended discussed how to better prep for STEM education in the classroom. In attendance were about 40 personnel from five different states and delegates from Kuwait and Mexico. They met with Meghan Smith, former Chief Technology Officer, who facilitated their meeting with Hannah Grady at the Senates office. They also spoke with Jeff Weld about the STEM program. Mr. Aguire asked if they got to meet with Senator Flake. Emilio stated they did not get to meet him but did get to meet some of the people from his cabinet. Mrs. McNamara asked what was next because he met with Governor Ducey last year and now has met people at a National level. Emilio stated there is a Summit in Kuwait that he wants to attend so he can speak with other delegates about the STEM program.
- Mrs. Reynolds presented the overall goals at Freedom ES. She stated to increase the letter grade the they are aiming to increase the number of students who are proficient particularly in math, increase the rate of growth, and increase the number of student who score proficient on AZELLA. Grade level plans have identified what percentage needs to increase in ELA and Math by grade levels. To achieve the goals for ELA they are looking at the strategies and monitoring of target small groups, argument writing focused on RI 8 text evidence, and implement vocabulary and reading comprehension. To achieve the goals for math they are looking at the strategies and monitoring of whether the right content is being taught, is the level of rigor going to reach proficiency, and are the opportunities being given to the students to perform the task in the context. She further stated to make the STEM program more visible they will partner with the Science Center to implement EIE in K-2, inquiry based teaching for K-8, have family STEM nights, and take field trips. She stated the Invention Convention was on Thursday 08, 2018 between 5 p.m. to 7 p.m. The campus celebrations and recognitions include the Science Olympiad, the 5th grade team STAR project, CSO Emilio was selected to go to Washington, D.C., and Stacey Jones was awarded a \$5,000 grant for anti-bullying from the Fiesta Bowl Charities. Mr. Aguire asked if they could be invited when the science project event occurs and expressed how appreciative he was with Mrs. Reynolds and the progress the school has been making.
- ASBA Certificate of Boardmanship – Dr. Shough presented a certificate to Mr. Jensen on behalf of the ASBA for his ongoing Boardmanship.

II. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – None

III. ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS

1. Quarterly Financial Report for Quarter Ended September 30, 2018
Ms. Baysinger shared the first quarterly report for the FY 2018-2019 which encompassed the first 3 months of the fiscal year. She further stated it is meant to provide updated information to the Governing Board on a quarterly basis and will assist in providing a better understanding of the financial status of the District. In an effort to keep the Governing Board apprised of the District financial status, in addition to the regular payroll and accounts payable voucher reports, included in the Governing Board packets is the Quarterly Financial Report for quarter ending September 30, 2018. The fiscal year runs from July 1 through June 30, with quarters ending September 30, December 31, March 31, and June 30. The report information is verified with the County Treasurer balances and includes fiscal activity for all funds for each period. Ms. Baysinger further reviewed the quarterly revenues. Mr. Jensen asked if there was a comparison to determine if their budget was on track. Ms. Baysinger stated the business office could run reports to determine how the numbers compare. Mr. Aguire stated he would like to see the numbers versus the percentage. Mrs. McNamara stated the numbers can change so she recommends reviewing the percentage. Dr. Shough stated that the reports will be provided each quarter and will offer the prior year's budget for comparison.
2. A-F School Letter Grades
Mrs. Camp discussed the K-8 model. She stated the model is 50% growth, 30% proficiency, 10% English Learning proficiency, and 10% acceleration readiness. She shared Las Brisas Academy and Rainbow Valley ES moved from a "C" to a "B" schools, Westar ES moved from a "C" to an "A" school, Estrella Mountain ES is a "B" school, Liberty ES and Freedom ES are "C" schools. Mrs. McNamara thanked Mrs. Camp for her presentation and congratulated the principals.
3. Stipend Study
Mr. Nuttall recognized the team members who participated in the stipend study. He further stated they analyzed the types of stipends awarded, evaluated the workload associated with the stipends, assessed the consistency of the compensation amounts for the stipends, and compared stipend hourly rates/set amounts to determine market competitiveness. The stipend categories will include hourly academic and academic, athletic and hourly athletic, club activity and hourly activity, Gifted, special education and special education hourly, coaching, recruitment contract, and non-district determined. The hourly rates of pay level 1 \$20 per hour for participation in professional learning, collaboration on grade-level teams, level 2 \$25 per hour for facilitating students either in academic or non-academic purposes, level 3 \$28 per hour for participating in district-wide committees where expert teachers are required, and level 4 \$30 per hour for facilitating or leading other teachers in a coordinator or trainer capacity. Mrs. McNamara asked if there were any studies to find out if there are any fallout with the coordination. Mr. Nuttall replied stating the equity is being balanced with a workload and there are no recommendations for more or less money per hour. Dr. Shough stated the key for determining the stipends was based on the classroom and the number of hours. The expectations will be consistent with the positions.

A motion by Mr. Jensen was entered to recess for a break.

RECESSING OF THE REGULAR MEETING FOR BREAK

BREAK SESSION 7:57 PM – 8:05 PM

RECONVENING OF REGULAR MEETING 8:05 PM

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS CONTINUED

RECONVENE TO REGULAR MEETING

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS CONTINUED

4. Attendance/Enrollment Report
Dr. Shough presented the attendance and enrollment report for September and October.
5. Class Size
Mr. Nuttall discussed the STAR (Student/Teacher Achievement Ratio). He further reviewed a prominent study supporting smaller class sizes. The study focused on K-3, conducted in 1984-1988, results of the STAR class-size experiment suggest that the internal rate of return from reducing class size from 22 to 15 students is small, around 6%. (Krueger, 2003) Student/Teacher Ratio in two scenarios; class size limit of 17 with one teacher and class size limit of 25 with one teacher and one paraprofessional. Some research suggests lower class results in: higher test scores for grades K-3, higher letter grades, fewer discipline incidences, and lower SES and Title I populations garner more significant impacts with lower student teacher ratios than other populations. Research has produced mixed findings Class Size Studies. Summary for Liberty includes teacher staffing of 48.8 teachers per 1000 students. Liberty employs 177.5 teachers not including preschool teachers, counselors, special

education teaching staff, or instructional coaches. Ms. Baysinger stated Liberty has a commitment to the public voter approved 10%. Maintenance and operations budget override to maintain class sizes at 27:1. All current Student/Teacher Ratios are operating within 1.3 or less of Target class size. She further reviewed the class size ratios and stated the Governing Board in December will approve the class sizes for FY2020. Dr. Shough stated the purpose is to provide information. Mr. Jensen asked if there was any information regarding paraprofessionals. Dr. Shough stated some school districts do have reading specialists which lowers class sizes. The district would not recommend anything higher than 27:1 and wants to improve teacher effectiveness toward student achievement. Mr. Aguire questioned if the classroom sizes increased how it would affect behavioral issues and discipline. Dr. Shough asked for any suggested material the Governing Board would like to review. Mr. Aguire stated it would be lowering the K-2, increasing the 6-8, and leaving 3-5 where they are currently. Mr. Lopez-Bearden stated adding a paraprofessional to K-3, don't like raising 7-8 grade because of social media and bullying. Dr. Shough confirmed the data would include a paraprofessional.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA

A motion by Mr. Aguire/Mrs. Lopez-Bearden was entered to approve the November 05, 2018 Consent Agenda with the exception of Consent Agenda Item 7 and ensure Consent Agenda Item 1 reflects the changes on the District Website.

- | | |
|--|------------------|
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 1. Approval of Minutes of the October 01, 2018, Regular Board Meeting; October 11, 2018, Special Board Meeting; and October 26, 2018, Public Meeting Notice. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 2. Approval/Ratification of Payroll Vouchers 109, 110, 1009 and 1010 in the amount of \$1,508,444.03. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 3. Approval/Ratification of Expense Vouchers 1911, 1912, 1913, 1914 & 1915 the amount of \$828,986.05. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 4. Approval of Student Activity Fund for the month of September, 2018. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 5. Approval of Gifts & Donations for October 1, 2018 through October 25, 2018. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 6. Approval of Personnel Action Items. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 7. Approval of School Donation Agreements: Rainbow Valley 2011, LLC and Garrett Walker Homes. This agenda item was pulled from the consent agenda. | |
| 8. Approval of Arizona School Facilities Building Renewal Grant - Request for Funds for Rainbow Valley HVAC Replacement Project. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |
| 9. Approval of Intergovernmental Agreement (IGA) - Maricopa County Department of Public Health. | |
| Approved | UNANIMOUS |

V. GENERAL BUSINESS

1. Discussion/Consideration to Approve the FY2018 SFB Preventative Maintenance Program Reporting Statement.

Ms. Baysinger it is an annual requirement of the School Facilities Board that each school district within the State of Arizona must submit a Preventative Maintenance Reporting Statement to that agency. A copy of that report for 2017-2018 was discussed and reflected the preventative maintenance activity for last fiscal year. Preventative maintenance is defined as services that are performed on a regular schedule at intervals ranging from four times a year to once every three years and that are intended to extend the useful life of a building system and reduce the need for major repairs. The report was prepared and signed by Mr. Kevin Gates who serves as the District's Supervisor of Maintenance and Grounds. Mr. Aguire asked if the checklist was a quarterly maintenance and was physically completed. Ms. Baysinger confirmed that the checklist is physically completed by maintenance. Mrs. McNamara asked if the maintenance is not done adequately would it affect us getting help for a rebuild. Ms. Baysinger stated all the documents they require they have provided to the Trust and are doing their best to answer any of their questions. Mr. Nuttall stated they do research on School Dude that schedules preventative maintenance, assign tasks, verify, check off and ensure the maintenance is completed. The district is working on making the work orders part of a routine.

A motion by Mrs. Lopez-Bearden/Mrs. McNamara was entered to approve the FY2018 SFB Preventative Maintenance Program Reporting Statement.

Approved

UNANIMOUS

2. Discussion/Consideration and Give Direction on Voting on one Bylaw Change Proposal and one Core Belief Addition from the Arizona School Boards Association.

Mr. Jensen stated the core belief is to add a statement that says every school board has their responsibility to champion and pursue educational equity for every student by challenging systematic inequities. The bylaw changes required 2/3 majority vote and is now changing to majority vote. Mrs. McNamara stated the systematic equity is vague and having the board agree on equity is a challenge. She stated she believes having a 2/3 vote is a larger majority to ensure more are invested in the change to the bylaws and having 51% of the vote is too low. Mr. Jensen asked if the board wants to approve the changes. Mrs. Lopez-Bearden stated she was undecided.

A motion by Mrs. McNamara/Mr. Aguire was entered give direction on voting on one bylaw change proposal and one core belief addition from the Arizona School Boards Association.

An amended motion was made by Mrs. McNamara/Mrs. Lopez-Bearden was entered to give direction on a Nay vote on one bylaw change proposal and one core belief addition from the Arizona School Boards Association. Mr. Aguire casted the dissenting vote.

Approved

MOTION CARRIED (3-YES, 1-NAY)

3. Discussion/Consideration to Adopt the Revision of Governing Board Policies DICA - Budget Format, DIE - Audits/Financial Monitoring, DN - School Properties Disposition, FCB - Retirement of Facilities, FEA - Educational Specifications for Construction, GBEAA - Staff Conflict of Interest, GCCH- Professional/Support Staff Bereavement Leave, IL - Evaluation of Instructional Programs, IMD - School Ceremonies and Observances, JEB - Entrance Age Requirements, JICK - Student Bullying/Harassment/Intimidation ~~Violence/Harassment/Intimidation/Bullying~~, JJIB - Interscholastic Sports, and JLCD - Medicines/Administering Medicines to Students as Recommended by the Liberty Elementary School District Administration and Arizona School Board Association (Policy Advisory Revisions) - Second Reading.

Dr. Shough stated this is a second reading for adoption. Mr. Jensen stated the district is looking into a PTO (paid time off) sharing system and a bank would be there for the PTO group. Mrs. McNamara stated it is still separate from the bereavement and after five days the board would still need to recommend if they the PTO needs to use the bank. Dr. Shough stated it is a separate policy from ASBA but they have given sample language. The teacher advisory is reviewing and will be brought to the Governing Board in December. Mrs. McNamara asked if at that time if they can retro it for the teachers at Estrella Mountain ES. Dr. Shough stated they will review it with the advisory group and look into the legalities to determine if it can be made retroactive as of November 01, 2018.

A motion by Mr. Aguire/Mrs. Lopez-Bearden was entered to Adopt the Revision of Governing Board Policies DICA - Budget Format, DIE - Audits/Financial Monitoring, DN - School Properties Disposition, FCB - Retirement of Facilities, FEA - Educational Specifications for Construction, GBEAA - Staff Conflict of Interest, GCCH- Professional/Support Staff Bereavement Leave, IL - Evaluation of Instructional Programs, IMD - School Ceremonies and Observances, JEB - Entrance Age Requirements, JICK - Student Bullying/Harassment/Intimidation ~~Violence/Harassment/Intimidation/Bullying~~, JJIB - Interscholastic Sports, and JLCD - Medicines/Administering Medicines to Students as Recommended by the Liberty Elementary School District Administration and Arizona School Board Association (Policy Advisory Revisions) - Second Reading.

Approved

UNANIMOUS

4. Discussion/Review of Revision of Governing Board Policies BCB - Board Member Conflict of Interest, BE - School Board Meetings, BEDF - Voting Methods, and JKD - Student Suspension as Recommended by the Liberty Elementary School District Administration and Arizona School Board Association (Policy Advisory Revisions) - First Reading.

Dr. Shough stated the policies are first reading and is open to any revised wording from the Governing Board. Mr. Jensen wanted to note many of the policies refer to the Governing Board.

This was an information item; no action was taken.

5. Discussion/Consideration to Approve the Benefits Specialist position, job description and placement on the Support Staff Wage Schedule at Level 19.

Mr. Nuttall stated The Liberty Elementary School District currently has a 1.0 FTE position that has gone unfilled. The Human Resources office recently conducted an internal audit of job specific responsibilities and duties to be carried out by the Human Resources Supervisor, Human Resources Technician, and Executive Director of Support Services. Though many of the duties and responsibilities are shared among all personnel within the Human Resources office, benefits is one area that is lacking consistency in customer service for the employees of Liberty Elementary School

District. It is the strong desire of the Administration to provide the best customer service to our employees. Additionally, the goal of the Human Resources department is to provide a comprehensive employment experience that serves all employee needs beyond only benefits. After researching local school districts with similar profiles, it was determined that the Human Resources office could not only operate more efficiently and effectively as a department but could improve the employee experience as well with the addition of a benefits specialist. The job description indicates minimum requirements and job duties that justify placement on the Support Staff Wage Schedule at a level 19, which indicates an hourly range of \$16.29 - \$21.81 per hour based on years of experience as described in the job description.

A motion by Mrs. Lopez-Bearden/Mr. Aguire was entered to approve the Benefits Specialist position, job description and placement on the Support Staff Wage Schedule at Level 19.

Approved

UNANIMOUS

6. Discussion/Consideration to Approve the Overnight and Out-of-State Travel - Student Field Trips.

Dr. Shough stated field trips are extracurricular activities that enhance academic efforts.

A motion by Mrs. McNamara/Mr. Aguire was entered to approve the overnight and out-of-state travel – student field trips.

Approved

UNANIMOUS

VI. GOVERNING BOARD COMMENTS

1. Governing Board Update

- o Mr. Jensen – N/A
- o Mr. Aguire – N/A
- o Mrs. Lopez-Bearden – stated she has attended several PTO meetings at Rainbow Valley ES, Las Brisas Academy, and Westar ES. One of the security officers attended Las Brisas and demonstrated what was expected with the lockdowns. It was informative for the parents, students, and teachers. She recommends all the schools to have the training. She attended the carnival at Liberty and enjoyed her time and unfortunately she was not able to attend Rainbow Valley. Las Brisas and Estrella Mountain have their carnivals this week and next week Westar is having their carnival.
- o Mrs. McNamara – appreciated how well Liberty ES PTO did at Peter Piper pizza fundraiser. They raised \$584. She went on her first field trip with her youngest to the State Fair and was proud of the kids and their ethics.

2. Future Agenda Items

- o Mrs. Lopez-Bearden – stated she enjoyed PeachJar and at the PTO meetings some of the parents have stated they have not been able to get on PeachJar. She suggests that the schools use PeachJar as a communication tool.
- o Mrs. McNamara – stated with the incidents between children and the buses have encountered loss, she would like to hear the struggles the bus driver and aides see on a daily basis. She wants to know how the District can educate the importance of bus stops. Dr. Shough questioned if she would like it as a discussion or an agenda item. Mrs. McNamara stated what transportation deems more comfortable. She would like to know how the District can help them with their job in an update or meeting. Dr. Shough stated they will incorporate some of their goals and safety concerns.

Agenda Item IV.7 Approval of School Donation Agreements: Rainbow Valley 2011, LLC and Garrett Walker Homes.

Mr. Jensen asked about the timeframe. Dr. Shough stated the Garrett Walker is imminent and the building development near Rainbow Valley it is unclear of how early they are moving forward. They have taken it to the city council and is pending board approval. She worked with the District's attorney and the developer's attorney's to include specific language to determine if it is a school site. The developers are still considering whether the community will be an adult community versus a single family community. If it becomes an adult community it is a generous agreement to include a rooftop fee. If the percentage of the development is 30% single family homes a school site may be needed for the development. Mr. Jensen asked if there is a timeline for the school. Dr. Shough stated with will work with the developers.

A motion by Mr. Aguire/Mrs. Lopez-Bearden was entered to approve the school donation agreements: Rainbow Valley 2011, LLC and Garrett Walker Homes.

Approved

UNANIMOUS

VI. UPCOMING GOVERNING BOARD MEETINGS:

December 10, 2018 - Regular Monthly Board Meeting

VII. ADJOURNMENT OF BOARD MEETING

On a motion entered by Mrs. Lopez-Bearden/Mrs. McNamara and by unanimous vote the Governing Board Meeting ended at 9:11 p.m.

Signed:

Date:

December 10, 2018

UNCONFIRMED